



**CITY OF WINTER PARK
HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD**

9:00 a.m.
August 24, 2016
Commission Chambers
401 Park Avenue South

MINUTES

1. Call to order. The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

Present: Chairman Bill Segal, Phil Wood, Genean McKinnon, Laura Armstrong, Bob Schwetje, and Ed Sabori, Chuck Bell. Absent: Phil Kean. Staff: Planning Manager Jeffrey Briggs, City Architect Brooks Weiss and Recording Secretary Lisa Smith.

1) Approval of Minutes: July 13, 2016

**Motion made by Laura Armstrong, seconded by Chuck Bell to approve the July 13, 2016 meeting minutes.
Motion carried unanimously.**

Public Comments on any item not appearing under action: No one wished to speak. Public comment closed.

2. Action Items.

- 1) HDA 16-005 Request by Mrs. Martha Hall to designate her home at 331 West Lyman Avenue, Winter Park, Florida as a historic resource on the Winter Park Register of Historic Places. Zoned R-1A.

Planning and Community Development Director Dori Stone presented the staff report. She explained that the residence at 331 Lyman Avenue was built in 1958 by the Reverend Jerry Hall, as a result of his being displaced through eminent domain from his original home on Denning Drive (formerly Maitland Avenue). She presented the history of the subject property. She stated that the applicant, Ms. Hall, submitted her Historic Designation Application on June 8, 2016. Mrs. Hall based her application for designation based on the age of the house and the contributions of her husband, Reverend Hall and his historical significance in Winter Park. The house is now 58 years old and is of no remarkable historical architectural style other than a representation of the post-WWII development style that is still prevalent throughout Winter Park. It is a one story concrete block residence with two-car carport, on the corner of W. Lyman Avenue and South Virginia Avenue. Staff has received three letters of support for Mrs. Hall's application from Reverend Dr. Vivian Carrington and Rebecca Talbert, AIA, and Michael Spencer (attached).

Staff also contacted the Hannibal Square Heritage Center and emailed Ms. Mary Daniels and Ms. Fairolyn Livingston, historians for the Center and their reports were provided to the Board members as a part of the staff report. She noted that the reports state that Ms. Hall's deceased husband, the Reverend Jerry Hall was a prominent figure in Winter Park and active in representing the Hannibal Square Neighborhood. He was a street preacher and later founded the Prayer Mission Church, which is still located at 827 Lyman Avenue.

She explained that staff considered several factors in evaluating this application. First, the home located at 311 Lyman Avenue has no real architectural significance other than representing a post-war pattern of development that is still very prevalent city-wide. Second, while Reverend Hall was an important figure to the community, he passed away in 2008. It is still too early to know how his legacy and contributions to the city, especially in the Hannibal Square area will be determined. In reviewing the classification of "significance" with the staff at the Florida Department of Historic Resources, state staff recommended that "significance" be determined by the same threshold as a historic resource which is 50 years. Staff is hopeful that Reverend Hall's legacy will stand the test of time, but at this point it is too recent to determine that. While both the Historic Preservation Board and the City Commission have made it clear that they wish to encourage voluntary designations of resources, staff feels that designating this property may be premature. Staff would recommend not designating this property on the Winter Park Register of Historic Places at this time. Director Stone responded to Board member questions.

The applicant, Mrs. Martha Bryant-Hall, 331 West Lyman Avenue, and Maria Bryant, 450 South Virginia Avenue, used a Power Point presentation to provide the Board members with historical information regarding the life of her late husband Reverend Jerry Hall and the residence located 331 West Lyman Avenue. Mrs. Bryant-Hall stated that she feels that as it pertains to certain structures, they must be looked at holistically and the time period which it was built as to what qualifies the structure for designation. She also cited State of Florida Historic Preservation laws and what qualifiers are used to determine a structure's historic significance. They expressed concern with their experiences of the application submittal process and leading up to today's public hearing, specifically not receiving the public notices at their physical addresses and differing staff reports. They responded to Board member questions regarding Reverend Hall, the residence and his church building located at 827 West Lyman Avenue.

P&CD Director Stone spoke to the issue of differing staff reports. She stated that the initial staff report that Mrs. Hall received was a draft that did not properly cite the new historic preservation ordinance, and the final staff report was rewritten to cite the criteria of the new historic preservation ordinance. She apologized for any confusion that was caused by that. She also explained that the City of Winter Park's historic preservation ordinance overrides the State of Florida Historic Preservation Laws, and that every city has the right to establish its own laws. She maintained that the structure does not meet the Division 3, Section 58-456 (1) a and b.

Mary Daniels, 650 Canton Avenue, read a letter of support into the record from Dwayne A. Bryant dated July 12, 2016, and she also spoke in support of a project. Ms. Daniels stated that she feels more consideration should be given in what criteria is used to qualify homes in the neighborhood to be placed on the registry because it may not always be architectural.

Christine Madrid French, 656 North Park Avenue, introduced herself as the new Executive Director of the Friends of Casa Feliz. She briefly explained her background in historic preservation to the Board members. She spoke in favor of the request. She urged the Board to consider the wider context of the structure, including the history of Rev. Hall as an African-American community developer in mid-20th century Winter Park. She suggested that the City and Board consider a historic resources survey of the neighborhood to proactively document, identify and protect significant structures. She stated she feels that post World War II structures should be studied overall in the City to help guide community planning efforts. She cited national historic preservation standards for what qualifies a building as historically important, noting that cultural significance is equally important.

Javier Omana, 426 West Lyman Avenue, spoke in opposition to the designation. He stated that he agrees with the comments concerning giving Rev. Hall a higher level of recognition, but did not agree with placing the home at 331 Lyman Avenue on the register.

Kathleen Yanks, 200 St. Andrews Boulevard, Apartment 2205, read a letter of support into the record from Linda Goddard of St. Margaret Mary. She stated that she feels that as it pertains to the history of the African-American community, it has to be listened to a different way when determining a structure's historic significance. She added that she feels that there is more to it than the building.

Maureen Brady, 640 North Park Avenue, #23, read into the record a letter of support dated August 2, 2016, from Doug Ball, former City of Winter Park Police Chief.

Forest Michael, 358 West Comstock Avenue, spoke in favor of the designation. He briefly explained his professional background working with the Department of Defense designing housing for military communities. He noted that in his working experience with the DOD, the structure located at 331 West Lyman Avenue would qualify as a structure that is to be preserved based its unique and distinct architectural style that is currently recognized by the U.S. Government. He said that he feels that Rev. Hall's legacy was established long before he died. He suggested that the Hannibal Square Heritage Center and Hannibal Square Community Land Trust be consulted with regard to the importance of these structures in this regard.

No one else wished to speak concerning the request. Public Hearing closed.

Mrs. McKinnon stated that she did not support the historic designation in accordance with the criteria established in the new historic preservation ordinance. She stated that she would support an endeavor that provides greater recognition to not only to Rev. Hall, but to other members of the community that have made significant contributions to the community. She stated that she feels that honoring his life is greater than placing the structure on the Register. Mr. Bell stated that he has gained a greater understanding of Rev. Hall. He applauded the applicants for coming forward to request the designation and all the research that was done to make the presentation. He supported the idea of doing a resource survey. He does feel that there is significance to the structure, but did not feel that it withstands that language of the ordinance. Mr. Wood appreciated the applicant's presentation. He expressed full support of conducting the resources survey. He said that from an individual standpoint he does not feel that the house has great historic significance. He did not support the designating the house at this time but encouraged the applicant to return and pursue historic designation of the Prayer Mission Church of God in Christ building. He also stated that he feels that Reverend Hall is due a greater level of recognition. Mr. Schwetje stated that he was appreciative of the presentation made by the applicants, but feels that a greater level of recognition of his life is warranted. He did not support the designation for the same reasons as stated by in previous Board member comments. Mr. Sabori did not support the designation, but he acknowledged that Rev. Hall made significant contributions to the physical qualities of the Hannibal Community specifically the homes that he built. He agreed with the comments from the speakers on recognizing that there needs to be a different perspective necessary in evaluating structures in the Hannibal Square community. Mrs. Armstrong agreed with the previous comments of Board members regarding upholding the ordinance. She encouraged the applicants to reach out to Randy Knowles, Publisher, Winter Park Magazine, for a feature story on Rev. Hall. She said that would educate many more people to the contributions he made. Mr. Segal thanked the applicants for their informative presentation. He supported the suggestion to conduct a resources survey. He spoke to the need to uphold the ordinance.

Motion made by Laura Armstrong, seconded by Genean McKinnon to deny the request to designate 331 West Lyman Avenue to the Winter Park Register of Historic places as recommended by staff based on the current City Ordinance No. 3024-15, Division 3, Section 58-456 (1) a. and the revised Staff Report, dated August 24, 2016. Motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

- 2) HDA 16-007 - Request by Matthew McKeever, Owner and Fred C. Schaub Custom Homes, Applicant, to demolish the existing home at 1421 Highland Road, Virginia Heights East Historic District, Winter Park, Florida and replace it with a new 4,513 SF Italianate home at this same address. The Applicant also is requesting a Front Setback variance from 43 feet to 35.9 feet. The existing home is a non-contributing resource in the Virginia Heights East Historic District. Zoned R-1AA. Parcel ID. #07-22-30-8908-14-190. **THIS ITEM HAS BEEN WITHDRAWN. NO FURTHER ACTION IS FORESEEN AT THIS TIME.**

Staff Updates and Informational Items

These items were brought forward by staff as informational only.

- 1)
 - a) Temple House at 1700 Alabama Drive, Ms. Lisa Knight, Owner- Demolition of portions nearing completion and modifications agreed upon.
 - b) 425 Alberta Drive, Ms. Emilee S. Carleton, Owner- Presentation of ways to preserve this 1935 James Gamble Rogers II home.
 - c) 511 Melrose Avenue, FG Schaub, Developer- Presentation of ways to preserve the 1910 California Bungalow.
 - d) 1234 Lakeview Drive, New Owner under contract, John Pinel, Coldwell Banker, Realtor- 1922 Wood Sided Bungalow may be lost to New Home.
 - e) 1167 Lakeview Drive, Ms. Alexis Magargee, Owner has met with Staff and plans to make application for Historic Preservation of her 1922 home on Lake Virginia, based on the incentives allowed (setback variances for new Garage and third floor use).
3. New Business. There were no items of new business.
4. Adjournment. There was no further business. The meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa M. Smith,
Recording Secretary