



**CITY OF WINTER PARK
HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD**

9:00 a.m.
May 11, 2016
Commission Chambers
401 Park Avenue South

MINUTES

1. Call to order. The meeting was called to order at 9:10 a.m.

Present: Present: Chairman Bill Segal, Vice-Chair Phil Wood Genean McKinnon, Rebecca Talbert and Laura Armstrong. Absent: Candace Chemtob, Phil Kean and Louise Sprimont. Staff: Planning and Community Development Director Dori Stone, Planning Manager Jeffrey Briggs and Recording Secretary Lisa Smith.

2. Approval of Minutes: No action was taken on minutes at today's meeting.

Public Comments on any item not appearing under action: No one wished to speak. Public comment closed.

Mr. Briggs recognized outgoing Board members Rebecca Talbert and Candace Chemtob. Mr. Kean was appointed for another three year term and there will be three new members Chuck Bell, Robert Schwetje, and Ed Sabori present at the June meeting.

3. Action Items.

1. COR 16-005 Request by Lien Pham on behalf of Pensco Trust Co. for a Certificate of Review for a two story addition at 407 Melrose Avenue. A variance is requested to allow a side setback of 7 feet in lieu of the required 20 feet to the lot line. A variance is requested to allow a floor area ratio of 39% in lieu of the allowed 38%.

Planning Manager Jeff Briggs presented the staff report and stated that this item was tabled at the April 13th meeting in order to give the Board members another opportunity to visit the site to see the context of this request. At the April 13th meeting, the homeowner provided the rationale and justification for the variances, which all of the Board members concurred with. Mr. Briggs noted that the subject property is an individually designated property. The house addition is in keeping with and complimentary to the existing architectural style of the home, which was also a conclusion of the HPC Board at the April meeting. For the benefit of the Board members that were not present at the last meeting, he reviewed the requested variances and the certificate of review request.

There are two neighbors that have sent letters of 'no objection'. There also are two emails that have been received that were provided to the HPC Board members voicing concerns primarily about impervious coverage and drainage issues. Mr. Briggs indicated that he has also talked with several neighbors and there will be conditions suggested to address, at least in part, the concerns that staff has heard.

One of the primary concerns from the April meeting was how to effectively utilize the 25-foot between the house additions and the street roadway of Oxford Road so there is ample room for landscape screening and street trees. Staff presented pictures of the existing conditions.

He said that in an effort to screen the view of the new addition, the applicant has agreed to maintain (and replace if damaged in construction) the existing podacarpus hedge along the street front and to plant two

new oak shade trees along the Oxford Road frontage to screen and buffer the view of the new two-story additions from the neighbors, as addressing the setback variance. Also to improve the street view, the existing storage shed along Oxford Road will be removed and re-constructed as an addition behind the garage on the east side so that it is out of view of neighbors on the Oxford Road frontage. Mr. Briggs stated that the new addition does take the applicant over the 50% maximum of impervious coverage. He said that the fail-safe in this instance is that no building permit would have been issued until a new survey and impervious calculations had been submitted. The applicant will be required to do complete a new 2016 survey and to have the surveyor calculate and certify as correct, the existing impervious coverage and then the applicant will need to make "compensating subtractions" from the impervious coverage in order not to exceed the code maximum of 50% impervious coverage. One method, proposed by the applicant to accomplish this, (in whole or in part) is to remove the existing concrete driveway out to Oxford Road and then replace it with a new gravel driveway and new concrete apron (in the city r/o/w to keep the gravel on-site). Staff has recommended approval of the request with these requirements. Mr. Briggs responded to Board member concerns.

Lien Pham, 407 Melrose Avenue, and Builder Bill Lynch, agreed with the staff recommendations. She indicated her willingness to resolve any issues that may arise and introduced Bill Lynch as the contractor. Mr. Lynch gave an overview of his experience. He wanted to assure the Board members and neighbors that every measure will be taken to ensure that the addition blends in with the existing neighborhood and that there will be minimal construction impacts upon the neighborhood given the tight streets, lack of on-street parking, etc.

Leon Huffman, 1128 Oxford Road, represented his mother. He asked that they be sensitive to the issue of water run-off and that they be sensitive to neighbors when the construction begins.

Patrice Shirer-Wynn, 461 Fairfax Avenue, opposed the requested variances. She did not feel that they are in keeping with the existing neighborhood. She also expressed concern that non-conforming structures have been constructed in the City right-of-way which she noted that she has been working with Code Compliance to resolve.

The applicant rebutted that she is has worked with Code Compliance with regard to the structures in the right-of-way and that she has moved shrubs a total of three times in an effort to remedy the visual obstruction.

George Wiggins, Building Official, provided some insight into the issues raised by Mrs. Shirer-Wynn. He stated that he has made an official complaint to Public Works as no right-of-way utilization permits have been issued.

No one else wished to speak concerning this request. Public Hearing closed.

Mr. Wood detailed his concerns regarding impervious coverage, water run-off and the age of the survey submitted with the packet. Mrs. McKinnon stated that the home is a contributing historic resource to the city as a whole, and that the applicant has worked to resolve the outstanding issues from the April meeting. She supported request. She stated that she is comfortable with the HPB responsibility in the request and comfortable that the other issues raised would be alleviated during construction. Mr. Segal agreed with Mrs. McKinnon and confirmed with staff that all of the issues raised and conditions discussed by the Board in response to citizen comments are also part of any action by the Board. Mr. Briggs responded that the commitments described by him, that have been agreed to by the applicant and the applicant's representations at the meeting are part of the public record and others as discussed by the Board in response to citizen comments are to be contained within any motion to approve (and as customary, included in the minutes)

Motion made by Genean McKinnon, seconded by Laura Armstrong to approve the request as presented by staff and as further elaborated upon by the applicant and HPB including the following:

1. That the construction project will be undertaken by a certified general contractor and not via homeowner construction;
2. That a new 2016 survey will be presented to the City, prior to the issuance of any building permit that will certify as correct, the impervious coverage and that the building permit will include the method and calculations of compliance with the maximum 50% impervious coverage on the site.
3. That in addition to maintaining (and replacing if necessary) the existing podocarpus hedge along Oxford Road, there will also be added two new shade trees spaced evenly between the existing tree and the driveway (of 4 inch caliper in size).
4. That the existing shed will be removed and that any new storage building addition onto the rear of the garage (matching the architectural style of the accessory building) shall meet the required 5 foot minimum side setback to the west and 10 foot setback to the (north) rear.
5. That any structures constructed within the City right-of-way will be removed or approved via a right-of-way encroachment agreement, prior to the issuance of a building permit.
6. That any other nonconforming structures (shade structure behind the garage) or nonconforming paving/paver stones will be removed permanently and that the applicant will proactively grade the site to minimize any off-flow of storm water onto any adjacent property.

Motion carried with a 4-1 vote. Phil Wood voted against the motion.

2. COR 16-006 Request by Elizabeth and David Corddry for a Certificate of Review for alterations including an expansion to the second story, and to enclose the existing rear open porch and balcony at the residence located at 346 Vitoria Avenue. A variance is requested to allow the second floor expansion to utilize the existing 4.4 foot side setback in lieu of the required 10 feet. A variance is requested for a continuous side wall plane of 45.3 feet in lieu of the allowed 36 feet.

Planning Manager Jeff Briggs presented the staff report and noted that this item was withdrawn at the April 13th meeting due to notice issues. He said that the homeowners have provided the rationale and justification for their variance requests. He reviewed the requested variances and the certificate of review request. He said that the house additions are in keeping with and complimentary to the existing architectural style of the house. He said that the one affected adjacent neighbor to the west, the Schofield's at 358 Vitoria has provided a well-reasoned compromise for approval. It breaks up the long unarticulated wall that would be facing their home with a three-foot additional setback for the second floor and a traditional mission tiled roof element that softens the façade facing their home. Staff recommended approval of the request subject to the following conditions:

1. Approve the enclosure of the first floor rear porch and second floor balcony; granting a variance to allow a continuous sidewall plane of 45.3 feet in lieu of the required 36 foot side wall articulation.
2. Approve the second floor addition with the condition that the northwest side wall of the second floor be recessed 3 feet from the first floor side wall plane with a tiled shed roof transition; granting a variance to allow a 7.4 foot side setback to the second floor addition.

David Corddry, 346 Vitoria Avenue, agreed with the staff report. He stated that they are agreeable to the compromise. Mr. Corddry responded to Board member questions and concerns.

Cindy Norris, Architect, was also present to respond to Board member questions and concerns.

Wendy Brannon, 318 Vitoria Avenue, stated that she was not opposed. She spoke concerning the dynamics of the existing neighborhood. She agreed with Mr. Wood's concerns regarding water run-off and that more attention to detail be given to the streetscape.

John Schofield, 358 Vitoria Avenue, the most affected neighbor expressed appreciation for the compromise that was reached.

No one else wished to speak concerning the request. Public Hearing closed.

The Board members were in support of the request.

Motion made by Laura Armstrong, seconded by Genean McKinnon to approve the request subject to the conditions recommended by staff:

1. **Approve the enclosure of the first floor rear porch and second floor balcony; granting a variance to allow a continuous sidewall plane of 45.3 feet in lieu of the required 36 foot side wall articulation.**
2. **Approve the second floor addition with the condition that the northwest side wall of the second floor be recessed 3 feet from the first floor side wall plane with a tiled shed roof transition; granting a variance to allow a 7.4 foot side setback to the second floor addition.**

Motion carried unanimously with a 5-0 vote.

2016 City of Winter Park Historic Preservation Awards.

Planning Manager Briggs offered the following for approval for the 2016 Casa Feliz Colloquium.

Excellence in Residential Renovation – *The Grover House*, 567 Osceola Avenue

Excellence in Commercial Renovation – *The Capen-Showalter House*, 633 Osceola Avenue

Excellence in Adaptive Reuse– *Osceola Lodge*, 231 North Interlachen Avenue and *Knowles Cottage*

The Board accepted the recommendations as brought forward by staff.

Staff updates.

Sue Massaline, representing the Friends of Casa Feliz, extended the invitation to the Board members to attend the Casa Feliz Colloquium scheduled for Saturday, May 21st beginning at 9 am.

Planning Manager Briggs introduced Brooks Weiss, new City Architect, who is set to start on June 1st.

Ms. Talbert requested that in moving forward that more attention to detail be given when new application packets are received. She had specific concerns that in recent months, impervious calculation sheets were not provided to Board members. She stated that she feels that those are necessary for Board members to have especially when considering variance requests. All Board members agreed with her comments.

New Business. There were no items of new business.

Adjournment. There was no further business. The meeting adjourned at 10:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa M. Smith,
Recording Secretary