



**CITY OF WINTER PARK
HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD**

9:00 a.m.
August 13, 2014
Commission Chambers
401 Park Avenue South

MINUTES

1. Call to order. Chairman Randall Glidden called the meeting to order at 9:10 a.m. and adjourned the meeting because a quorum was not present.

Present: Chairman Randall Glidden, Rebecca Talbert (participated via teleconference), Genean MacKinnon Michael Miller, Candace Chemtob, Louise Sprimont, Barbara De Vane and Phil Wood. Also Present: City Attorney Robin McKinney. Staff: Planning & Community Director Dori Stone, Senior Planner Lindsey Hayes and Recording Secretary Lisa Smith.

2. Approval of Minutes

No minutes were approved at today's meeting.

- Public comments on any business not appearing under action

There were no public comments received at this time in the meeting.

3. Action Items.

HDA 14-002 Designation of the property known as Grant Chapel located 216 West Lyman Avenue to the Winter Park Register of Historic Places. Zoned O-2. Parcel IDs #05-22-30-9400-68-011, 05-22-30-9400-68-012, and 05-22-30-9400-68-021.

Senior Planner Lindsey Hayes presented the staff report. She explained that the building known as Grant Chapel was originally located at 301 West New England Avenue. Additionally, in an agreement with owner Morney Partnership, Ltd., the City agreed to process a rezoning for property 216, 224, and 234 West Lyman Avenue to Office (O-2) so that if the rezoning was approved, Grant Chapel could be relocated to the new site and placed into service for that zoning district's permitted uses. The rezoning was approved and the historic Grant Chapel building has been relocated and placed into service. She explained that this is step number three in fulfilling the conditions of the agreement listing the building as a historic property. The Board members were provided with copies of the agreement and correspondence from the city attorney's office. She provided the Board members with an extensive historical overview of the subject property, the issues relating to relocation of the building. Ms. Hayes explained that the relocation of the Grant Chapel building had special considerations. To retain its association with the history of Hannibal Square, it was relocated to a site in the neighborhood. The current lot is triangular. The general setting is fairly compatible with the original, even though the new landscape and hardscape is considerably more structured and formal. The building has been reoriented to face New York Avenue from a distance beyond a decorative brick wall and courtyard, and a side elevation is oriented toward Lyman Avenue. The use is compatible with the building.

The stairways that flank the entry and lead down to the basement diminish the integrity of the character of the front of the building, however the basement entrance could be relocated in the future and the facade returned to its original appearance. Staff recommended APPROVAL to designate Grant Chapel at 216 West Lyman Avenue as a historic resource in the Winter Park Register of Historic Places.

Ms. Hayes, Planning and Community Development Director Dori Stone, Assistant Building Official Kris Stenger, Assistant Building Official, responded to Board member questions and concerns.

Mrs. De Vane stated that she is concerned that the Board is asked to consider designation with the changes that the building has gone thru. She said that she feels that the building has forever lost the potential to be on the national registry, and its character has been altered dramatically on the exterior. She did not did not express opposition to the addition of the basement; however, she did express opposition to the possibility of a slate roof, a steeple, and the amount of landscaping that has been added. She said that if a situation like this should occur in the future it is her hope that the national registry guidelines will be adhered to.

Mrs. Chemtob stated that she was astonished that this did not come to the Board prior to today especially considering the significance of the alteration. She was in agreement with the comments made. She expressed disappointment that the Historic Preservation Board was not included in the process for the relocation of the building. Further, she said that she feels that this is a lose/lose situation because the alterations have already been completed.

Mr. Glidden stated that he was taken aback as well to see the changes. He referenced the relocation of Casa Feliz and that building having maintained its national register designation. He expressed concern with the addition of the basement. He said that he feels that it must be constructed sensibly and in accordance to the needs of the building. He said expressed no opposition to the relocation of the building, but stated that he feels that the orientation of the building is what has affected the historic character of the building. Now, he feels there is not a clear distinction of what is old versus what is new. Further, he felt that the entry to the basement changed the front look of the building. He also noted that there are too many variances from both the secretary of interior standards and the technical recommendation from the department of interior with regard to historic buildings to offer this as a historic building. The alterations have effectively reduced the historic fabric and historic nature of the building to the point where he feels that is a disservice to other designated properties on the register, and is precedent setting. He was also concerned that the agreement did not require that the building be brought to the HPB prior to the building being relocated.

Mr. Wood thanked Mr. Glidden for his comments. He stated that although he agrees with many of his comments, he feels that the final product is excellent and that it will be an asset to the City. He agreed with Randall's summation of the issues regarding the aesthetics, but feels that there are some pluses (i.e., the basement and the way it was done and the way the building is laid out on the site, the basement is not noticed as you are driving by.) He said that he feels that the historic portion of the building looks intact. He agreed that many of the things that have been added are touchy (i.e.: the new electrical). He said that he feels that the building has character and good history. He said although he is not able to vote, he encouraged the members of the Board to give strong consideration to approving as a historic resource to ensure that the City can maintain a degree of control.

Mrs. Sprimont expressed concern that the national register does not take into consideration the neighborhood significance over the architectural historical significance.

Mrs. MacKinnon asked if Ms. Hayes was brought in during this process when these decisions were made. Ms. Hayes responded that she was not. She explained that her role is now that this request is before the HPB. Mrs. MacKinnon expressed concern with regard to process and that the historic preservation staff was left out of the process.

Ms. Hayes noted that Ms. Talbert has joined the meeting via teleconference.

Ms. Hayes also responded to Board member questions and concerns with regard to the national register designation process and the permitting process. She noted that the Board has no purview with regard to interior changes. Robin McKinney addressed questions concerning the development agreement.

Planning and Community Development Director Dori Stone explained that this particular item went thru the rezoning process first, second it went thru the building permit review process. She said that the basement is not something that would typically go thru a board. She said that the applicant submitted for a building permit thru the Building Department, that the basement is exclusive to the site and is internal to the development. She acknowledged that the DA did not require that the applicant go thru the HPB process prior to moving the building. She spoke too many of the concerns raised by Board members. She said that numerous discussions have taken place with the Developer with regard to what he can and cannot do. She assured Board members that staff has learned valuable lessons from this particular issue and will be more forward thinking in the future with regard to special situations that may require development agreements, as well as better coordination between the building and planning department to ensure that this does not happen again.

Stephen Pategas, 1425 Berkshire Avenue, stated that what happened with the process and this particular building is strange and unfortunate; however, still feels that it is a great asset where it is to the City.

Betsy Owens, Casa Feliz, said that she feels that this, in particular, underscores the bigger issue of the weakness of the present ordinance to deal with any historic building that is not on the Winter Park Register (i.e.: the Knowles Chapel, Grenada Court, the Annie Russell Theatre, the Urgood Building). She stated that she feels that the ordinance is toothless when it comes to buildings that have not been voluntarily designated.

No one else wished to speak concerning this issue. Public Hearing closed.

Motion made by Genean MacKinnon, seconded by Michael Miller recommending designation of Grant Chapel located at 216 West Lyman Avenue as a historic resource in the Winter Park Register of Historic Places. A roll call vote was taken. (MacKinnon and Miller voted in favor of the motion. Chemtob, Talbert, Glidden and Sprimont voted against the motion.)

- Selection of HPB Chair and Vice-Chair

Mrs. MacKinnon withdrew her name for Chair. She explained that her time constraints of her current obligations, she would not be able to fulfill the duties.

Motion made by Ms. Talbert, seconded by Mrs. Sprimont to close the nominations for Chair. The nomination of Mr. Glidden, from the previous meeting, stands. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion made by Mrs. Sprimont, seconded by Mrs. Chemtob to nominate Rebecca Talbert for Vice-Chair of the Board. Motion carried unanimously.

4. New Business

- America in Bloom presentation, Abbie Gulden and Stephen Pategas.

Stephen Pategas, 1425 Berkshire Avenue, explained that he is a member of the Keep Winter Park Beautiful and Sustainable Advisory Board and the Chairman of Winter Park Bloom. Mr. Pategas provided the Board members with an extensive overview of the America in Bloom program, Winter Park Blooms, and the role that can be played by the Board. He responded to questions posed by Board members.

Ms. Hayes updated the Board members that the Casa Feliz committee has been meeting and will be returning to the Board with some recommendations. She said that staff plans to have recommendations and comments in place for consideration prior to picking back up the remaining elements of the ordinance amendments. Also, staff said that staff is looking at responses from the survey to coordinate some language for additional incentives that can legally be included in the ordinance if they can be a separate policy outside of the ordinance for designated properties.

5. Adjournment. There was no further business. The meeting adjourned at 10:45 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa M. Smith,
Recording Secretary