



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Minutes

August 29, 2019 at 9:00 a.m.

City of Winter Park Commission Chambers

Call to order.

Call to order. The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

Present: Bob Schwejte, Ed Sabori, Jason Taft, John Skolfield, Tracey Curry, Wade Miller and Drew Henner: Absent: Laura Armstrong. Staff: City Architect, Brooks Weiss; Planning Director, Bronce Stephenson and Recording Secretary, Kim Breland.

Approval of Minutes:

Motion made by John Skolfield, seconded by Tracey Curry, to approve the January 9, 2019 meeting minutes. Motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

Election of Chair and Vice Chair:

Motion made by Bob Schwetje, seconded by Ed Sabori, to nominate Laura Armstrong as Chairman for the Historic Preservation Board. Motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

Motion made by Ed Sabori, seconded by Jason Taft, to nominate Bob Schwetje as Vice-Chairman for the Historic Preservation Board. Motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

Action Items:

- COR #19-003 Request by Ian Olgilvie to: Construct a 130 square foot addition to the rear of the existing home at 422 Holt Avenue in the College Quarter Historic district.

Planning Manager Jeff Briggs explained that the item was a Certificate of Review from Ian Olgilvie to construct a 130 square foot addition to the rear of the existing single-family home at 422 Holt Avenue, located within the College Quarter Historic District.

Mr. Briggs stated that the applicant is proposing to build a 130 square foot addition on to the back of the home, which will be of the same architectural style as the original home and then rebuild the deck on to the rear. He provided slides of the home showing the location of the home in the College Quarter showing the back of the home pointing out the deck, which is in need of repair.

Mr. Briggs stated that the addition is 6 ft. 6 inches from the eastern property line and the applicant is requesting a 6-inch variance from the 7-foot side setback requirement. He referenced the photo of the rear of the home noting that portion of the building is already inset leaving it further away from the neighbor than the balance of the house as it goes toward the street.

Mr. Briggs provided elevations of the proposed addition and summarized by stating that the proposed structure met all of the code criteria.

Staff recommended approval of the request.

Applicant Ian Olgilvie, 422 Holt Avenue, Winter Park, FL. addressed the Board. Mr. Olgilvie noted that prior to his purchase of the home in April of 2019; the home had been a rental property for a number of years. He explained that in his talks with neighbors, he was asked if his intent was to rent the home. Mr. Olgilvie explained that his intention is not to rent the property, but to make it his permanent home for the foreseeable future and he is excited to work on restoring the home to its original beauty.

The Board heard public comment from:

Norma English, 411 Holt Avenue, Winter Park, FL. Ms. English welcomed Mr. Ogilvie to the neighborhood and asked questions regarding the side setbacks and wanted to clarify there would be no parking in front of the home.

Nancy Galyean, 746 McIntyre Avenue, Winter Park, FL. Ms. Galyean stated that she was delighted that someone purchased the home who would live in it and take care of it. She expressed concerns regarding a dumpster that has been sitting on the sidewalk since the beginning of June, which has destroyed the sidewalk leaving it unsafe. She asked that the dumpster be removed and asked that the owner replace the sidewalk as soon as possible.

No one else from the public wished to speak. The public hearing was closed.

The Board agreed with Staff's recommendation. The consensus was that the addition was in keeping with the architectural style and that the variance was de minimus.

Motion made by Ed Sabori, seconded by Tracey Currey to approve the COR request of Ian Ogilvie to construct a 130 square foot addition to the rear of the existing home at 422 Holt Avenue in the College Quarter Historic district.

The motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

- HDA #19-002 Request by April Hughes to: Individually designate the 1952 home at 2230 Howard Drive as a historic landmark within the Lake Forest Park neighborhood.
COR #19-002 Request by April Hughes to: Build 973 square feet of additions to the existing 1,574 square foot one-story masonry home at 2230 Howard Drive.

Mr. Briggs presented the staff report explaining that the item was a two-part request from April Hughes to designate the home at 2230 Howard Drive to the list of Winter Park Historic Properties and for approval to build 973 square foot of additions to the existing 1,574 square foot one-story home at 2230 Howard Drive.

Mr. Briggs stated that the applicant currently lives on Glencoe Road property and discovered the property on 2230 Howard Drive and would like to restore the home to its original Mid-Century Modern architectural style. He stated that the home is typical of the MCM style and may be one of the Sorensen + Fletcher design/built homes, so prevalent in Winter Park in the 1950's and 1960's. He summarized by stating that the scale of the home contributes to the heritage of the architecturally diverse neighborhood. Staff recommendation is for approval.

Mr. Briggs moved on to discuss the COR request. He showed photos of the existing home, which is in need of repair. He stated that other residents in the neighborhood have taken the old style of home, modernized it, and showed examples of homes updated with the same style.

Mr. Briggs stated to accomplish restoring the home at 2230 Howard Avenue, the applicant would like to fix up the home and make needed additions. He reviewed the repairs and additions as listed in the staff report and discussed setbacks and the variances requested. Mr. Briggs noted letters of support received by Staff from the neighbors on both sides of the property as well as other neighbors.

Mr. Briggs summarized by stating that Staff is in support of the application for designation, repairs, and additions with variances. Staff recommended approval of the request.

Mr. Briggs answered questions from the Board.

Applicant April Hughes, 1510 Glencoe Road, Winter Park, FL addressed the Board. She noted that her current home is another historically designated home in Winter Park. She explained to Board how she discovered the home on Howard Drive, which she found beautiful and wanted to own and restore to its original splendor. She explained the repairs and additions she wanted to make to the home and reiterated her affection for the home and asked the Board for their consideration with her request.

The Board addressed the applicant and commended her willingness to designate and restore the home. No one from the public wished to speak. The public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed the designation and COR requests and agreed with Staff recommendations.

Motion made by Wade Miller, seconded by John Skolfield for approval to individually designate the 1952 home at 2230 Howard Drive as a historic landmark home within the Lake Forest Park replat.

The motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

Motion made by Ed Sabori, seconded by Jason Taft for approval to build 970 square feet of additions to the existing 1,544 square foot one-story masonry home at 2230 Howard Drive, zoned R-1A.

The motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

- COR #19-004 Request by Grady Cooksey to: Build a 1,546 square feet of additions to the existing 1,783 square foot two-story home at 420 Melrose Avenue. The home was built in 1925 and is a previously designated Historic Landmark

Mr. Briggs presented the staff report and explained that the item was a COR request for the property at 420 Melrose Avenue. The home was voluntarily designated on the list of historic places in September of 2018. He explained that the owners have put the home on the market and have a prospective purchaser who is the applicant making the COR request, Grady Cooksey and the offer on the home is contingent upon the approval of the additions being requested for the 1925 home.

Mr. Briggs showed slides of the location of the home and noted that the property is a corner lot. He reviewed the right side setbacks (10ft.) of the home shared with the neighboring home on lots 3 and 4 and the rear setback (25ft.) to the neighbor to the south. He went on to review the additions requested by the applicant and related variance request.

Mr. Briggs then showed renderings of the proposed home with approved additions and variance. He reviewed, in detail, the setbacks for the first story and second story additions and stated the applicant was following code with respect to the terracing of the second story addition. The applicant is segmenting the second further back to be respectful to the neighbors, per code, at the 10 ft. setback for the first story and 25 ft. for the second story.

Mr. Briggs pointed out that at the rear of the property there is a one-story frame stucco accessory dwelling that was remodeled from a garage into a habitable space, which is two feet away from the neighbor to the south. The applicant, in an effort to relieve any effect on the neighbor has agreed to remove the structure from the property, in compensation for the garage variance. Mr. Briggs provided aerial photos of the accessory dwelling, showing its proximity to the fence and property line of the neighbor to the south. He showed additional views which pointed out the significant area of the yard area going out toward Richmond Road as well as images of the landscape screening around along then common property.

Mr. Briggs stated Staff was pleased to have the property on the historic designation list and explained that the designation allowed the applicant can apply for variance requests to the Historic Preservation Board. He stated the role of the historic designation is not to be punitive, but to work with the homeowners in terms of their plans and to the extent variances are requested as long when they are reasonable and do not pose hardship on neighbors as to aid historic preservation. He briefly discussed issues related to the opposition to the request of the neighbor to the south, Bernard Martin. He noted that Staff was in support of the applicant's request because the combination of removing the habitable structure from the rear of the line and building a garage that does not make noise and maintaining the landscape screening is sufficient compensation for the variance request.

Staff recommended approval of the request.

Mr. Briggs answered questions from the Board regarding corner lot variances processes lot split process on properties the size of the home at 420 Melrose Avenue.

Applicant Grady Cooksey addressed the Board. He stated that he was trying to make a significant investment with the home, which is in need of improvement. He explained that the home does not have a garage or carport. He stated that when he presented his initial plans for the property to the neighbor, which included a 10ft. setback, the plans were rejected. He then had his architect redraw the plans at a 25 ft. setback, but after reviewing the plans, it was clear that the plans would not work for the structure needed to be built and the investment he was willing to make for the property, which is why he requested a variance. Mr. Cooksey noted that he, his architect and realtor made numerous attempts to talk to Mr. Martin, but their efforts were unsuccessful.

Mr. Cooksey then answered questions from the Board regarding landscape plans and driveway configuration.

The Board heard public comment from:

Bernard Martin, 1230 Richmond Road, Winter Park, FL. Mr. Martin requested additional time to present his concerns to the Board. He stated that he worked with an architect to develop plans that would allow the applicant to build the additions to the home without any variances. He then asked the Board if any members had affiliation with the organizations provided in his presentation handout to which the members stated that none had any affiliation. Board member Ed Sabori stated for the record that he has resided at the property across the street from 420 Melrose for over 30 years.

Mr. Martin then provide a definition of a variance by the 5th District Court of Appeals. He gave a presentation with slides for homes where variances were denied for similar corner lot homes. He went on to discuss in depth, the variances that had been denied for other properties adjacent to his property. Mr. Martin went on, at length to address his concerns related to the proposed garage the applicant would like to build, the existing accessory dwelling and landscape issues. He presented the design he worked on with his architect and reiterated that he felt his design would work on the property without any variances.

Mr. Martin stated that the Commission expressed concerns regarding residents learning their rights related to setback infringements and the discord it could create amongst neighbors. Lastly, he showed photos of his home, which is a signature, cut stone home such as the Gamble Rogers homes, which is double the value of other homes in the area and expressed his opposition to the request.

Sim Seckback, 420 Melrose Avenue, Winter Park, FL. addressed the Board and stated that he agreed to designate his home after being approached by former City of Winter Park Architect Brooks Weiss. He stated that at the time of designation he was assured that the designation would not have an impact on any sale of the home. He stated that he chose to designate his home to prevent it from being torn down, as the tearing down of homes had become a trend in the neighborhood. He addressed the Mr. Martin's property and stated that he built a privacy fence to screen his view from construction trucks on his property.

Lastly, Mr. Seckback appealed to the Board to approve the applicant's request to alleviate the issues Mr. Weiss guaranteed he would not have with selling the home.

Laura Finn, PO Box 566, Osteen, FL. Mrs. Finn stated that while she presently lives in Osteen, Florida, she grew up at 420 Melrose Avenue. She asked the Board to approve the variance request to relieve the hardship the owner is experiencing with selling the home.

No one else from the public wished to speak. The public hearing was closed.

Mr. Cooksey responded to Mr. Martin's proposed design. He reiterated that he had his own architect had created a design in the 25 ft. setback with the desired additions for the home and the additions could not be done. Mr. Cooksey stated that if the variances were denied he would have to end his contract to purchase the property because he would not be able to build. He acknowledged that the burden was not on the Board.

The HPB Board members discussed the requests and variances requested. They noted that the 10 foot setback requested was the same setback enjoyed by the neighboring property that was objecting to the variance. They agreed that the removal of the non-conforming accessory living quarters building that was 2 ft. from the property line was in the best interest of the City. Board members noted the extensive landscape buffer that exists on the common property line which will screened this addition substantially from view of that objecting neighbor. Their unanimous conclusion was that the additions and variance would have no negative affect upon the neighboring property.

Motion made by John Skolfield, seconded by Tracey Curry for approval to build a 1,546 square feet of additions to the existing 1,783 square foot, two-story home at 420 Melrose Avenue. The home was built in 1925 and is a previously designated Historic Landmark.

The motion carried unanimously with a 7-0 vote.

Non- Action Items:

a. Planning Director's Report:

Mr. Skofield asked that the Board consider opportunities as an incentive for designation of historic homes to provide more flexibility regarding lot splits. Planning Manager, Jeff Briggs responded to Mr. Skofield's input telling the Board that this would be an agenda item when the Board met next on October 9, 2019.

The meeting adjourned at 10:35 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kim Breland

Recording Secretary