1
2
Đ
G

### **Historic Preservation Board**

### May 9, 2018 at 9:00 a.m.

Commission Chambers • City Hall Second Floor 401 South Park Avenue • Winter Park, Florida

### administrative

- a) Call to order.
- b) Approval of the April 11, 2018 meeting minutes.
- c) Public comments on any business not appearing under action.

### action

- a) Incentive 3. Rehabilitation Grants Updated verbiage and discussion of possible action on the proposed chances to the grant.
- b) 2018 Historic Preservation Awards- voting on winners from List of Nominees, presented at last meeting, April 11, 2018.

### non-action

- a. 1015 Greentree Drive- The CURREY Residence reconstruction.
- b. Staff Report on this month's activities.
- c. Casa Feliz hosts "The Winter Park Historic Homeowners Celebration", Thursday, May 10 from 6:30-8:30pm in honor of Designated Historic Homes in Winter Park.
- d. Board Appreciation Event: "IT'S PAR-TEE TIME"- Wednesday, May 23, 2018 from 5:30-7:00pm at the Winter Park Country Club at 761 Old England Avenue.

### adjourn

The next regular HPB meeting will be 9:00 a.m. Wednesday, June 13, 2018.

### appeals & assistance

"If a person decides to appeal any decision made by the Commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing, he/she will need a record of the proceedings, and that, for such purpose, he/she may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based." (F. S. 286.0105).

"Persons with disabilities needing assistance to participate in any of these proceedings should contact the City Clerk's Office (407-599-3277) at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting."







9:00 a.m. April 11, 2018 Commission Chambers 401 Park Avenue South

### MEETING MINUTES

1. Call to order. The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

Present: Bill Segal, Bob Schwetje, Chuck Bell, Laura Armstrong, Ed Sabori and John Skolfield. Staff: Director of Planning and Community Development, Dori Stone; City Architect, Brooks Weiss and Recording Secretary Kim Breland.

### Approval of Minutes:

Motion made by Bob Schwetje, seconded by Chuck Bell, to approve the March 14, 2018 meeting minutes. Motion carried unanimously with a 5-0 vote.

- 2. Action Items
- a) COR 18-001.1 Request by John and Joanna Skolfield to demolish and remove the existing 8' x 20.3', 162.4 sf one-story wood (shed) Accessory Building at the southeast corner of the property at 358 Vitoria Avenue, located within the College Quarter Historic District. This shed was built about twenty years ago and has no historic significance.
- b) COR 18-001.1 Demolition Permit to remove the original shed located at 358 Vitoria Avenue, in the College Quarter Historic District of Winter Park.

Zoned: R-1AA Parcel ID # 07-22-30-1490-03-070 Original Home Built: 1925

John Skolfield recused himself from this item.

City Architect, Brooks Weiss presented the staff report. He explained that the Owner proposes to build a new 600 sf one-story garage with concrete slab, wood frame walls with stucco to match the original home, and wood frame roof with green shingles in this same southeast corner of the lot. The new garage will meet current building setbacks of 5' Side Setback' and 10' Rear Setback.

Mr. Weiss explained that the new structure also meets all requirements of the Winter Park Land Development Code and has been reviewed and accepted by George Wiggins, Director of the Building and Permitting Services Department of Winter Park. He presented an elevation diagram containing the measurements for the height and width of the new garage along with the new design for the Board to review. Mr. Weiss summarized by stating the new garage proposed meets all of the design guidelines of the College Quarter Historic District as well as meeting all of the requirements of the building code. Staff recommendation is for Approval. Mr. Weiss answered questions from the Board. He reiterated that the items brought before the Board today were:

- a. Approval of demolition request 18-001.1 for the original shed at 358 Vitoria
- b. Architectural design approval of the garage elevations as requested from the March 14th meeting

Director of Building and Permitting services, George Wiggins spoke next. He informed the Board attorney representing Mr. Skolifield's neighbor came to him with a concern regarding the size of the opening of the garage being more than the ten-foot allowance per the zoning code. Mr. Wiggins confirmed that the code does state that garages facing the street do have a 10-foot opening limit. However, this case is unusual as the garage being built is at the rear of the property, which is 172 feet long. Mr. Wiggins stated that Mr. Skolfield presented a design option with an additional panel opening at the top of the garage which would open (tilt up) above the garage doors to allow a large vehicle to enter the garage. Mr. Wiggins stated that he told Mr. Skolfield that, the architecturally, the proposed option looked like a good solution for the garage. He stated that the Historic Preservation Board did have the authority to grant a two-foot height increase variance allowing for the panel addition, which would accomplish the intent of the zoning code. He closed by stating that the Historic Preservation Board has granted variances for much larger buildings, much closer to the property throughout the Historic District and the applicant has met all of the criteria to build the garage.

Attorney, Alison Yurko, represented Mariolina Salvatori, Mr. Skolfield's neighbor who is opposing the garage being built. She provided documentation to support Ms. Salvatori's concerns about the proposed garage. She stated that Mrs. Salvatori's home at 1055 Lakeview Drive abuts to the rear of Mr. Skolfield's property and will be impacted by the construction of the garage. She reiterated that the code states that no front facing garage can be more than 10ft in height and that the proposed garage would obstruct Ms. Salvatori's view from her backyard pool. In addition, Ms. Yurko discussed issues and concerns related to the lack of paved driveway leading to the proposed garage as it will be used to store a recreational vehicle. She expressed concerns that Mr. Skolfield maneuvering a large recreational vehicle in a tight space next to his house creates a liability to his existing tenant residing in an existing cottage at the rear of the property. She remarked that the proposed garage is not an adaptive appropriate reuse to the property and Historic District and is lacking historic character. She concerns that in the future the applicant will turn the garage into another cottage, creating an Air B and B dwelling. She summarized by stating that the Historic Preservation Board should deny the demolition permit and architectural review for the proposed garage, based on the points addressed in her presentation.

The Board asked Ms. Yurko if there was a possible middle ground for her client, Ms. Salvatori and Mr. Skolfield in which Mr. Skolfield would plant trees behind the garage so that Ms. Salvatori would not have to see the garage. Ms. Yurko stated that the trees were not a viable solution as the view was not the only concern; the function of the structure itself was troubling for various reasons including. Additionally, she indicated that she was not certain trees could be planted; as transmission lines exist at the rear property line.

Ms. Salvatori, 1055 Lakeview Drive, spoke to the Board. She stated that her house looks out to Lake Virginia, a public view that she enjoys. However, the backyard is her private space and the construction of the garage would obstruct the open view. She expressed concerns to her rights to an unblocked view versus Mr. Skolfield's rights to build the proposed garage.

The Board then posed the question to Ms. Salvatori regarding the applicant planting trees behind the garage to create a more pleasant view as a compromise. Ms. Salvatori was opposed to the trees being an option as her view would still be blocked from her backyard.

There was discussion between staff, the Board and Ms. Yurko regarding the length of Ms. Salvatori's lot and how much of it abuts against the Skolfield property. Further discussion ensued.

Applicant, John Skolfield, 358 Vitoria Avenue, addressed the Board. He responded to concerns expressed by Ms. Yurko and Ms. Salvatori. He addressed issues related to the driveway, explaining that in order to keep the property within code for impervious land area; he would not be extending the existing driveway to the garage. He stated that he does not intend to convert his garage to a cottage and is opposed to the Air B and B concept in Winter Park. Mr. Skolfield stated that the garage was in any way a safety hazard for his tenants in the cottage at the rear of his property. He reviewed the architectural elevations for the Board to show the aesthetics would match the main home.

Mr. Skolfield answered questions from the Board regarding adaptive appropriate reuse, unreasonable mass on property in the Historic District.

The Board heard public comment from Brad Moore, 367 Vitoria Avenue. Mr. Moore stated that he owns the home directly across the street from the Skolfield residence. He explained that Mr. Skolfield showed him the plans for the proposed structure and he has no objections.

Ms. Yurko addressed the Board. She stated addressed comments related to the issue of transmission lines at the rear property line. She pointed out that this is not a "by right" structure and the only way the structure could be built is if the Board granted the additional two-foot height variance as the code states the opening of the garage cannot exceed ten feet. She reiterated that the structure does not meet the standards of the Historic Preservation Board code, is not an appropriate reuse and has a negative impact on the surrounding area. She stated that in her informal discussions with people in the neighborhood regarding this issue, people were aghast that this would be allowed in Winter Park. Lastly, she closed with saying that allowing the structure to be built so close to Ms. Salvatori's backyard was not appropriate and should be denied.

The Board and Staff conducted an in depth discussion regarding the height code requirements for garage/accessory structures. They discussed the issue of adaptive reuse of the structure to the property. Mr. Weiss explained that the proposed garage met all of the building code requirements per George Wiggins, Director of Building and Permitting and that further questions regarding those code requirements should bemade to the Building Department and were not a concern for the Historic Preservation Board. Mr. Weiss stated that the Board had the right to allow the two-foot height increase variance for the proposed panel above the garage doors.

Ms. Yurko addressed the Board; she insisted that Mr. Wiggins stated that he could not permit the structure unless the Board approved the additional two-foot height variance because it is not up to code.

There was discussion from the Board regarding allowance of a variance for the panel above garage doors. The Board expressed concerns about neighbor input regarding the proposed structure. The Board expressed concerns about how the motion for the request would move forward. Further in depth discussion ensued.

### Public Hearing was closed.

Director of Planning and Community Development, Dori Stone addressed the Board. She explained that one of the privileges of living in the Historic District and/or owning a historic home is that Historic Preservation Board is able to handle the variance process. She stated that this allowance is under the Historic Preservation charter and the City's charter and part of the guidelines of having a historic structure. Mrs. Stone explained to the Board that it was in their purview to grant Mr. Skolfield the additional two-foot height variance under both the College Quarter guidelines as well as their purview of the Historic Preservation Board and does not have to go before any other board. She stated that she understands that the Board has heard from Mr. Wiggins as well as Mr. Weiss' recommendation and based on that, if a variance is needed to the opening of the structure, which

Historic Preservation Board

is in the design and in the Board's purview to also approve, the Board has it in their authority to approve the request. Further discussion ensued.

Motion made by Laura Armstrong, seconded by Bob Schwetje to approve COR 18-001 Request by John and Joanna Skolfield to build a one-story, less than 600 square foot Accessory Structure at the rear of their home including approval of a variance for the additional two-foot height panel above the garage doors at 358 Vitoria Avenue, in the College Quarter Historic District of Winter Park. Vote was 3-2 against; motion failed. (Bob Schwetje and Laura Armstrong voted to approve the request, Ed Sabori, Bill Segal and Chuck Bell voted to against the request.)

\*\*After Bob seconded, Mr. Segal asked if there was any further discussion. Board member Chuck Bell asked if the Winter Park code allowed the parking of a recreational vehicle in the rear yard of a lot. Mr. Weiss responded that it was not allowed in an "open" situation, a 75% opacity screening is required to cover any large vehicle, boat, etc. There was further discussion about the structure meeting the code and whether or not recreation vehicle parking appropriate for a historic area and the impact on the character of the neighborhood as well as whether the architecture contributes to the neighborhood. Further discussion ensued.

Incentive 3. Rehabilitation Grants - Updated verbiage and discussion of possible action on the proposed changes to the grant.

This item is being continued to the May 9th meeting for further discussion.

- 3. Non-Action
- a) 2018 Historic Preservation Awards

This item is being continued to the May 9th meeting

4. Adjournment

There was no further business. The meeting adjourned at 10:54 a.m.

The next Historic Preservation Board meeting will be held Wednesday, May 9, 2018 at 9:00 a.m.

Respectfully submitted, Kim Breland Recording Secretary



### ITEM 2.A

### HISTORIC PRESERVATION INCENTIVES

### 1. Reduced or Waived Building Permit Fees

The city has the ability to reduce or waive permit fees. Currently, the permit fees are calculated at 9/10% of the value of the overall construction. The reduction or loss of building fees as permitted by law are relatively insignificant to the overall new construction taking place in the city. This incentive would only apply to designated properties. The City commission could also set an annual limit on fee waivers or reductions.

### 2. Undergrounding of Electric Services

Electric Utility currently charges customers up to \$3,000 to run the electricity from the street into the house. This program would waive the cost of that connection. This incentive could be applied to individual resources.

### 3. Rehabilitation Grants

The concept of the rehabilitation grant program is based on the housing rehabilitation and business façade programs currently operating within the city's CRA district. This program would be for resources valued under \$400,000 based on the Orange County Property Appraisers office. The program would provide a 50% match to a property owner for exterior improvements. The maximum city matching grant it is \$25,000 per property. The property-owners would be required to own the property for an additional five years or pay back a pro-rata share of the grant to the city. A resource receiving this incentive would be require to first list their property on the city's Register of Historic Places and, if appropriate, apply for the National Register of Historic Places.

The following conditions apply to this grant:

- a. The Owner shall pay the first 50% (up to \$25,000) to the Contractor, then the City will pay the final 50% (up to \$25,000) upon completion of the work.
- b. This grant is available to the same Owner only once every two (2)years.
- c. Of the total amount of the Contract (up to \$50,000.00 total) only ten percent, or up to \$5,000.00 (Five Thousand Dollars), can be attributed to the landscaping and irrigation of the property.

### 4. Preparation of National Register Applications

As a means to encourage that the most historically significant properties receive National recognition, the City would assist with the staff effort and expense of preparing and submitting National Register of Historic Places applications should a property owner desire to seek this national recognition.

### 2018 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS

April 2018

CATAGORIES:

- 1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION
  - a. **Temple-Knight House**, 1700 Alabama Drive- Z Properties, General Contractors
  - b. **411 Garfield**, Evelyn Kelly, Owner/Designer; Jason Sellers (SEI Custom), General Contractor
  - c. **Casa Colina**, 863 N. Park Avenue, Greg Engelman, Owner, Frank Roark, General Contractor, Steve Feller, Architect (just now nearing completion)
  - d. **1023 Lakeview Drive**, Elizabeth and Jim Faiella, Owners, renovation to Victorian style in late 1980's. Nominated by Bob Schwetje, HPB.
  - e. \_\_\_\_\_

### 2. EXCELLENCE IN COMMERCIAL RENOVATION

- a. Buttermilk Bakery, 1198 Orange Avenue 1925, Taissa Rebroff, Owner
- b. **Marlowe's Tavern**, 1990/2003 at 1008 S. Orlando Avenue- renovation from a McDonalds- Architect/Partner, Tom DiGiorgio
- c. **Prato's Restaurant**, 1922-124 N. Park Avenue, Luma on Park, Parent Company-Windfall Properties, LLP
- d. \_\_\_\_\_
- e. \_\_\_\_\_

### 3. EXCELLENCE IN ADAPTIVE REUSE

- a. **State Auto**, 1946- 2016 at 1280 Orange Avenue- Multi-use Building, Lamont Garber, Owner, Michael Wenrich, Architects
- b. Architects Design Group, 1901 at 333 N. Knowles Ave., ISK Reeves, Owner, Architect
- c. The Lumber Yard, 2016 at 784 Orange Avenue, Lumber Yard, LLC, Owner
- d. \_\_\_\_\_
- e. \_\_\_\_\_
- 4. **EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL** Making notable contribution/achievement to Historical Preservation in Winter Park
  - a. **Scott Austin Sidler**, President/Owner of AUSTIN Historical, Preservationist and Restoration Builder for the Geer/Van den Berg/Panepinto House
  - b. Zane Williams, Z Development for the Temple House + 774 Maryland Ave.
  - c. **Dr. Jack Lane**, Wendell Professor of American History, Emeritus and College Historian of Rollins College, Author of "In Praise of the Humble Bungalow" and "ROLLINS COLLEGE Centennial History, A Story of Perseverance 1885-1985"

d. \_\_\_\_\_ e. \_\_\_\_\_

### 2018 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS

### April 2018

### 5. AWARD FOR

a. Centurian Award for Homes over 100 Years Old: The "It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old because It's Good" Award- Homes individually designated at this time:

	i.	Eastbank- Comstock-Harris	1901	724 Bonita Drive
	ii.	Kummer-Kilbourne House	1915	121 Garfield Avenue Award
	iii.	Waddell House	1901	1331 Aloma Avenue
	iv.	Currey House	1910	1015 Greentree Drive
	ν.	Grover House	1916	567 Osceola Avenue Award
	vi.	WP Country Club House	1914	761 N. Interlachen Avenue
	vii.	Capen-Showalter House	1885	633 Osceola Avenue, A.Polasek
	viii.	Partin Family Cemetery	1850's	2500 Modac Trail
b				

- C. \_\_\_\_ d. \_\_\_\_\_
- e. \_\_\_\_\_

### 6. OTHER AWARDS

a.	 			 		
b.				 		
c.						
d.						
e.						



### 1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION

### •1.a TEMPLE/KNIGHT HOUSE 1878/1904/1922/2017

1700 Alabama Drive- Jim and Lisa Knight, Owners; Z Properties, General Contractors





MINIERO III TETCRIC LIDEDUAR CO Tome Prise Profession Profession



### 1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION

### 1.a TEMPLE/KNIGHT HOUSE 1878/1904/1922/2017

This historic structure was fully restored to a modernization of its original form. Earlier inappropriate modifications were removed, the exterior porches were restored and the interior was totally updated with period materials to make this one of Winter Park's best restorations.



<sup>12.</sup> Alabama Drive

Moved in the 1920's to make may line the hotel and fong associated with Winter Park, Mistory, the house was usened by the Parkwonds, the Palmers, and in 1960 purchased by Carne (emply, wile of W. C. Temple, Mr. Temple, a succi industrialite, seweet the forestimet of the Mitsburgh Parates basebull team and formulated the idea and suck for the Wintl Writes. He was active in Winter Park society and hereof in a "The house or specific Davids," The Temple condition and such to the Wintl Writes. The team of the Minter Park society and hereof ina. The house or specific Davids, The Temple condition and a constraint wints in the new in the 2025's for use by the hord Usak.





### 1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION

### 1.b 411 Garfield Avenue, 1925 Evelyn Kelly, Owner and Jason Sellers (SEI), General Contractor

The Owner has restored similar small residences in other cities in the US and wanted a residence in Winter Park. She completely renovated the exterior and interior of this historic home to a showplace benchmark for all of Winter Park.





### **1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION**

 1.c CASA COLINA, 1925- 2018 Gregory Engleman, Owner; Frank Roark, General Contractor; Steve Feller, Architect (just now nearing completion).





### **1. EXCELLENCE IN RESIDENTIAL RENOVATION/PRESERVATION**

I.C CASA COLINA The Owners and Architect spent many months reaching a design solution to enlarge the original historic home and succeeded in fully retaining the character, scale and details of the original. Great work.





### 2. EXCELLENCE IN COMMERCIAL RENOVATION

# • 2.a BUTTERMILK BAKERY, 1925

1198 N. Orange Avenue, Ralph Kuhn, Owner An historic structure lending to the scale and heritage to Orange Avenue Corridor.





### 2. EXCELLENCE IN COMMERCIAL RENOVATION

# -2.b MARLOWE'S TAVERN, 1990/2003

1008 South Orlando Avenue, Tom DiGiorgio, Partner/Architect A former *McDonalds*, transformed into a contemporary, well-scaled good architectural solution- great example of a sustainable renovation.



### 2. EXCELLENCE IN COMMERCIAL RENOVATION

# = 2.c PRATO WINTER PARK 1922/2012

214 N. Park Avenue Owner: LUMA on Park,

Windfall Properties, LLP







### **3. EXCELLENCE IN ADAPTIVE REUSE**

# •3.a STATE AUTO BODY, 1946/2015

1280 Orange Avenue, Garber Capitol, LLC, Owner; Michael Wenrich Architects; LAMM & Company Partners, General Contractors





# **3.b** 2018 HPB AWARDS NOMINEES**3. EXCELLENCE IN ADAPTIVE REUSE3.b** ARCHITECTS DESIGN GROUP (ADG)1901- 333 N. Knowles AvenueImage: Marchitect Comparison of the state of the sta

12

### **3. EXCELLENCE IN ADAPTIVE REUSE**

# • 3.c THE LUMBER YARD, 1947/2016

### 784 Orange Avenue, Lumber Yard, LLC, Owner

This adaptive reuse of the Thomas Lumber building is great for the renaissance of Orange Avenue. The simplicity and bold use of graphics adds a fresh new look.





### 4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL

- •4.a Scott Austin Sidler, President/Owner of AUSTIN Historical, Preservationist + Restoration Builder
- Scott has been doing the restoration work on the Geer/Van den Berg House (1876), one of the oldest homes in Winter Park since the Panepinto family purchased it.





# 4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL

# •4.a Scott Austin Sidler, AUSTIN Historical

 Scott is also very active in the community, speaking out for Historic Preservation and has published a book "Old House Basics"

that provides encouragement and guidance to Home Owners as they understand the basics of restoring an older home.

#20 It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good.



The quick-start guide for any homeowner of an old or historic home who wants to learn what to expect from living in a vintage house and how to handle the inevitable "quirks" you encounter.

### About the Author

Scott Sidler is a licensed preservation contractor and the founder of Austin Historical, Inc. He is the best selling author of Living in The Pass and Old Windows Made Easy. He writes extensively about historic preservation on his website The Craftsmun Blog and tesides in Orlando, FL with his wife and three children.



### 4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL

### 4.b Zane Williams, Owner of Z|PROPERTIES

 Zane brought the design drawings for the restoration of the Temple House in for review, even though it is not a designated property, he wanted to make sure it was done correctly in accordance with HPB.



### **4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL**



- 4.b Zane Williams, Z|PROPERTIES @ 774 Maryland
- Zane also brought a "basket case" of a 1925 College Quarter rental home to us in 2016. The case was made for demolition, but creative architecture saved the spirit of the original and transformed it into an exemplary new citizen of the historic district.









### 4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL

•4.c Dr. JACK C. LANE, Wendell Professor of American History, Emeritus + College Historian of Rollins College, and Author of "ROLLINS COLLEGE Centennial History, A Story of Preservation 1885-1985"



### 4. EXCEPTIONAL INDIVIDUAL



- •4.C Dr. JACK C. LANE, Wendell Professor of American History, Emeritus + College Historian of Rollins College, and Author of Preservation Winter Park "In Praise of the Humble Bungalow".
- Dr. Lane has been a strong voice of preservation in Winter Park since he joined ROLLINS COLLEGE more than 30 years ago. His writings and knowledge form an informational base that is critical to the historic preservation in Winter Park.

### Preservation Winter Park

In Praise of the Humble Sungales

are suits a strength

As we are set to see the set of the set of the set of the first set of the se

In this paper of the set of the

I have a second over conservation proved, we will such the conservation of the conserv



### 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old

• 5. the CENTURIAN AWARD Awarded this year to individually designated homes of Winter Park in the spirit of:

"It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"

 Winter Park Country Club House 761 N. Interlachen Ave.
 1914 Resolution date: 3/26/2002 Owner: City of Winter Park



# **2018 HPB AWARDS NOMINEES**

### 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old

# • 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

"It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"

Kummer-Kilbourne House 121 Garfield Avenue

1915 Resolution date: 1/26/2004

Owner: Windsong Properties, LLC







# **2018 HPB AWARDS NOMINEES**

# 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

"It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"

The WADDELL HOUSE 1331 Aloma Avenue

**1901** Resolution date: 5/11/2005 Owners: Lurinda Smith Melissa Marlow This home is currently on the market for sale.



# 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

"It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"

The CURREY HOUSE 1910

 1015 Greentree Drive
 Resolution date: 7/13/2005
 Owners: Jeffrey + Tracey
 Currey
 Architect: Bill Childs
 Contractor: Farina + Sons



# 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

"It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"

### The GROVER HOUSE

567 Osceola Avenue **1916** Resolution date: 10/12/2005 Owner: Kerry Sean Mcloughlin



### 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old

# • 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

- "It's Not Good Because It's Old, It's Old Because It's Good!"
- "EASTBANK" Comstock-Harris House 724 Bonitia Drive
   1901

Resolution date: 4/24/2006 Owners: Hutchison Beck Twachtman





25

### 5. AWARD for Homes Over 100 Years Old

# •5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

 The Capen-Showalter House 633 Osceola Avenue 1885

Resolution date: 1/25/2016

Owner: Albin Polasek Foundation Inc.





### 5. AWARD for Properties Over 100 Years Old

# 5.a CENTURIAN AWARD

The Partin Family Cemetery 2500 Modac Trail
 1850's Resolution date: 2 /12/2018

Owners Representative: Ms. Diana Niedermann







27

# **MAY is Historic Preservation Month!**

# **AWARDS Selection**

- Selection of Award Winners
- Announcement of Award Winners
- Letters out to Recipients
- Posting Awards on City Web Site
- Order Bronze Plaques
- Set Date and Place of Presentation



### **1015 GREENTREE DRIVE, WINTER PARK**

THE CURREY RESIDENCE, a 1920 individually historically designated home.

OWNERS: Jeffrey W. and Tracey M. Currey, 1015 Greentree Drive, Winter Park 32789

ARCHITECTS: William H. Childs, Jr. & Associates, Inc., 6 W. Washington Street, Chagrin Falls, Ohio

440.247.4122 bchilds@childsarchitects.com

GENERAL CONTRACTOR: Victor Farina & Sons, Custom Construction, 3432 Edgewater Drive, Orlando 407.509.5216, <u>victor@farinaandsons.com</u>

### HISTORY:

- The home was individually historically designated on July 13, 2005.
- The Owners came in with the Childs drawings, showing dates from 19 July, 2017 through 9 February, 20018 (this date marked "Filed for Approval")
- Brooks met Victor on site on February 9, 2018 and Victor walked him through the home, after the interior wall materials had been removed, to show Brooks the condition of the framing, quality of materials, methods used to fasten materials together and general condition of the building.
- At that time, Victor said that he would like to just tear the house down and totally rebuild it to replicate the original 1910 home and its original historic appearance.
- Brooks and Victor talked and because of the historic designation, it was agreed at that time, by
  Victor and Brooks that Farina & Sons would rebuild the house, wall by wall, thus restoring it to
  its former look and enhanced built condition. It was also discussed and agreed upon that the
  original horizontal wood siding would be reused, to the extent that it could be saved and
  effectively reused.
- Brooks also had multiple occasions to speak with Bill Childs and members of his senior staff, regarding the proposed changes to the external look of the house and the materials they were proposing to use, in place of the original wood siding. It was agreed that:
  - The roof over the north side of the second story would be modified to get rid of the twin gables that allowed a major leak condition- the result was a bit taller single gable that did not noticeably change the look of the street front of the home.
  - The use of BORAL wood-like horizontal siding to emulate the original wood siding. This was presented and also agreed to as part of an earlier presentation to the Historic Preservation Board and approved at that time.
  - Other minor modifications were also discussed and the Childs' drawings were approved by Brooks after these discussions and agreed changes to the Childs' modifications- none of which negatively impacted the Greentree Drive Elevation look of the home.
- 13 April 2018- Sean Woodard, Building Inspector, had questioned the extent of the new construction to the point where Victor called Brooks to see what was at question. Brooks then talked with Sean and decided to visit the site again that day to see for himself what the question was.
#### **1015 GREENTREE DRIVE, WINTER PARK**

- Brooks visited the home on 13 April 2018, and observed what appeared to be a completely new build of the original home. As Sean had noted, Brooks too questioned the process in getting to the "new" condition of the construction, framing, etc.
- Brooks called Victor from the site and they discussed what had happened since February 2018.
- Victor explained that about two weeks earlier, approximately the week of March 26, 2018, the decision had been made to demolish the old walls, floors (where required) and rebuild the frame in new conventional wood construction on the same footprint so the look of the original home could be replicated, as previously agreed upon, and as the Architects' plans had shown.
- Brooks advised Victor that he should have advised Brooks and the Building Department of such a markedly different approach to building the home. Victor apologized for not making the City aware of the approach some weeks ago.

#### CURRENT RESOLUTION

- Brooks met with George Wiggins, Director of Building and Permitting Services, Kris Stenger, Assistant Director, and Dori Stone, Director of Planning and Community Development.
- George suggested that a "Stop Work" be issued by Sean Woodard, until such time as the City can get updated architectural and engineering drawings delineating the construction work to date.
- George also wants the Builder and Owner to show how they have complied with the previous
  approvals of the Historic Preservation Board, confirming that the new construction does indeed
  meet the intent of all involved.
- George Wiggins will communicate with Victor Farina.
- Week of April 16- Meetings with Victor Farina, Brian Beach (Project Supervisor on-site) and Craig Brown, FDS Engineering Associates (Structural Engineers) to review all activities and plan forward; phone calls to Bill Childs, Architect, to discuss latest plans and get his input on reconstruction of original home.
- 23 April 2018- Meeting with Jeff and Tracey Currey, Owners, to discuss the process and how we will move forward; advising them that with the allowance to proceed, they do so at their own risk, until the HPB has heard the story.
- 24 April 2018- Brooks confirmed new architectural plans match the original plans submitted and approved by the HPB in April and June of 2016 and advises George Wiggins to release the "Stop Work" on the job. Victor Farina resumes construction.
- 9 May 2018- HPB to hear this.

Respectfully submitted,

Brooks Weiss, AIA

City Architect and Liaison to the Historic Preservation Board of Winter Park

END.

Sec. 58-480482. - Reconstruction of destroyed historic landmarks.

The loss less of local historic landmarks, resources or contributing structures within a historic district that have been destroyed by fire or other natural disaster may be ameliorated by efforts to reconstruct the resource. Reconstruction means the process of reproducing by new construction the exact form and detail of a demolished building structure or object as it appeared at a certain point in time. The HPCB shall encourage reconstruction when deemed appropriate and when such reconstruction is based upon evidence of the size, form, architectural style and detail of the demolished building. The reconstruction will be recognized as such in the Winter Park Register of Historic Places.

(Ord. No. 2688-06, § 1, Exh. A(58-457), 10-

9-06)

Sec. 58-481483-58-489. - Reserved.

#### **DIVISION 5. - ADMINISTRATION AND**

ENFORCEMENT

Sec. 58-490. Incentives.

The City may adopt additional incentives applicable to designated historic landmarks, historic resources and/or properties in a historic district, including but not limited to fee discounts or grant programs, at its discretion.

Sec. 58-491. - National Register of Historic Places nominations.

The HPCB shall review local nominations to the National Register of Historic Places and shall forward a record of their actions and recommendations to the Florida State Historic Preservation Officer.

- (1) The city commission, City Manager, Planning and Community redDevelopment department director, chief planner, owners of record and applicants shall be given a minimum of 30 and not more than 75 days prior to the HPCB meeting in which to comment on or object to the listing of a property in the National Register of <u>Historic Places</u>.
- (2) Objections by property owners must be submitted in writing and their signature notarized to prevent nomination to the National Register of Historic Places.

(Ord. No. 2688-06, § 1, Exh. A (58-458), 10-9-06)

Sec. 58-492. - Certified local government performance.

The HPGB shall apply to participate in the certified local government program through the Florida Division of Historical Resources. As part of the program requirements the HPGB shall:

- (1) Provide 30 days prior notice of all meetings to the state historic preservation officer.
- (2) Submit minutes of each meeting to the state historic preservation officer within 30 days of each meeting.

### WILLIAM H. CHILDS, JR. & ASSOCIATES, INC.

### A R C H I T E C T S P L A N N E R S

6 W. WASHINGTON STREET CHAGRIN FALLS, OHIO 44022 | TEL: 440-247-4122

April 23, 2018

Mr. Brooks Weiss City Architect Planning & Community Development City of Winter Park 401 Park Ave. South Winter Park, FL. 32789

Dear Mr. Weiss:

As you recall, William H. Childs, Jr. & Associates, Inc. is the architect of record for the [historic renovation] project at 1015 Greentree Drive, Winter Park, Florida (the "Project"). From the beginning of the Project, Victor Farina and Sons Construction Company, [the general contractor], has continually apprised both my firm and FDS Engineering, the [structural engineer], of numerous unanticipated existing conditions, including insect infestations, deficient structural members and foundations, extensive water damage and other noncompliant code issues which compromise the integrity of the existing home. These are some of the worst conditions I have experienced in 22 years of private practice and 10 years with a high-end residential historic architectural firms. Similarly, Ted Wolf, who has over 40 years' experience in historical residential architecture, has never seen a case so severe.

I believe that many of these conditions constitute life safety issues that absolutely must be addressed during the construction process. In my professional opinion, failure to remedy such issues would constitute negligence on the part of all parties involved. Accordingly, we urge the [historical commission, ARB] to allow the Project to proceed in accordance with the approved plans and specifications, subject to remediation of these deficient and potentially dangerous conditions.

Please feel free to contact me at your convenience should you or any other parties involved wish to further discuss this matter.

Sincerely,

William H. Childs, Jr. AIA President

MEMBER AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF ARCHITECTS



04/18/2018

Dear Mr. Weiss.

I have provided you with a USB loaded with photos and videos of the home that will give you a great perspective on our issues. Some are in sequence. One thing is certain: after removing drywall/plaster and insulation, it was the most revealing I have ever seen.

These videos/photos will clearly depict that we did demo and reframing in a sequence of attempting to save the home core structure as much as possible. Also, you will see many of the repairs or remodeling throughout the years made it virtually impossible to save because that area was so deficient. As I have mentioned and also shown you, samples of lumber pulled from the home in no uncertain terms this is the most challenging project in the sense of attempting to salvage walls.

We found out sooner or later there was not one single area more than two to three feet that was not affected by termites, beetle bores, water intrusion damage, and previous deficiencies from substandard remodeling to home. All windows were caulked shut as to divert water from entering the home. The water rot below many of the windows was extensive. Even the original structure of the exterior, interior walls with original framing was deficient - code or not. We found this home to be in an unsafe condition with all mentioned above. I am providing you samples of the upgrading siding that was agreed to use in this home, which is a minimum of a \$35,000 increase to the owner from the original selection. Every effort is being made to save/reuse/repurpose as much of the original materials that we can. For example, pine flooring, pine beams, interior French doors, etc.

Lastly, as we all know there is a 300-400 old camphor tree on this property, I am told it is the #2 or #3 largest in the state. Since the start of construction, this tree has been getting monthly health inspections. I myself have met with 4 different tree arborists, including the city of Winter Parks representative. All with the same common goal of protecting the tree. It was of the highest importance to the owners that this tree was not harmed during our construction. Between our company, Engineering and Architect we have worked tirelessly to do all we can to protect this tree.

As you know my family has been in the residential construction business since 1950, I am a second-generation builder. I was selected and recently completed the International Building Show Remodel Home in Rose Isle, and it was a 1937 home. Those interior walls were all saved, as we added additions and etc. to the home.

#### BUILDING QUALITY SINCE 1950

3432 Edgewater Drive, Orlando, FL 32804 • Phone 407-849-1731 • Fax 407-849-1733 • FARINAANDSONS.COM

Our company has completed several historical projects in City of Orlando, Polk County etc. Just a few years ago we were selected the Big 50 in remodeling magazine on the front cover. I stake my reputation on being thorough and honest and approach each project with professional integrity.

.

Thank you, Victor Farina, President

cop wes



April 24, 2018

City of Winter Park Building Department 401 South Park Ave Winter Park, FL

Ref:	Currey Residence
	1015 Greentree Drive
	Winter Park, FL

FDS job#: 16-1063

To Whom It May Concern,

This report provides a summary of the findings, observations, and recommendations to the referenced building. The structural design submittal dated October 4, 2017 was based on several exploratory visits during the earlier stages of design, with intent to modify only the necessary structural items and maintain the existing foot print and site location.

On December 6, 2017 it was brought to our attention that the interior finishes demolish has been completed. Therefore, FDS and the contractor Farina & Sons performed an assessment of the structural load carrying components.

- 1. The existing load carrying components; bearing walls, beams, floor framing and columns were not compatible or consistent with general construction practices to meet the current standards. The 2x wood components range in size, species, existing repairs and appear to be products from other modifications.
- 2. Evidence of previous Wood Destroying Organisms (WDO) was observed as well as water damage (Decay) throughout the area's inspected.
- 3. Exterior walls were found out of plane and not square
- 4. The floor system had visual slope and depression throughout, having an unsafe condition.
- 5. Visual observation of non-structural material used to support walls, floor and roof.

On December 27, 2017, we met on site to discuss the existing floor sloping concerns. Review and design was provided to reinforce with new floor framing, beams and masonry pier supports. The existing foundation would remain as is.

On January 3, 2018, with these design changes and deficiencies in the roof framing. The architect of record William Childs JR. & Associates presented elevation designs with the Historical Preservation Board and City Architect Brooks Weiss to replicate the existing elevations as closely as possible with Pre-Engineered trusses.

On March 15, 2018, additional site meeting to review interior foundations and damaged supports.

On April 2, 2018, it was brought to our attention to review the existing front portion. The existing front portion at first floors and second floor consisted of over-stressed beams and headers with inconsistent materials.

"Doing Business with a Service Mindset and an Eye for Detail" Page 1 of 4



Upon conclusion of our meeting, the building as a whole based on the Florida Building Code, it is our opinion that the extent of the observed damages is considered "Substantial Structural Damage". The intent was to try and maintain portions of the as-builds along with the new structural components. However, the extent of the load carrying components observed are consistent throughout. Therefore, as Engineer of Record we must be dedicated to the protection of the public health, safety and welfare.

It is our opinion, that the structural damages and the attempt to reconstruct the load carrying components and double roof system within the current state of these components would affect the building as a whole therefore, would not be recommended. It was a collective recommendation that the existing building be removed in portions and new structural building components be constructed following the current Florida Building Code 5<sup>th</sup> Edition 2014 –Residential, without modifying the foot print or location as approved. Final documents dated April 13, 2018 has been submitted for approval.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call.

Sincerely, FDS Engineering Associates





THE LT

"Doing Business with a Service Mindset and an Eye for Detail" Page 3 of 4





"Doing Business with a Service Mindset and an Eye for Detail" Page 4 of 4







CURRENT WEST ELEVATION

### 1015 GREENTREE DRINE. 9 FEB 2012



FRISTING ORIGINAL FRAMING - DUISTS NOT TOUCHING/UNDER-

### 1015 GREENTREE DRIVE: 9 FEB2018



EXISTING OBIGINAL RUS FLOOR FRANKING - "SISTERED" FLOOR JOYSTS







### 1015 GREENTREE DRIVE: 13 APRIL 2018 "STOP WORK"



NEW WOOD FRANKA (FRONT) - USING EXISTING BRICK FLOOR

# 1015 GREENTREE PRIVE: 13 APRIL 2018 "STOP WORK"



INTERIOR : NEW WOOD FRAMING & CONNECTORS

## 1015 GREGHTREE DRIVE: 3 MAY 2018



RECONSTRUCTION IN PROGRESS

### HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD: STAFF REPORT for Month of April 11 - May 9, 2018

#### 9 May 2018

During the last month, we have given attention to the following matters, not included in Agenda for the May 9<sup>th</sup> meeting:

- 1. 1565 Orange Avenue, Howard A. Gross House, 1926, Frederic Wallace, Owner
  - a. Letter of Invitation written to Mr. Wallace
  - b. Individual Designation Application, Incentives and Q+A Brochure sent to Owner, in response to phone inquiry.
- 2. **751 Antonette Avenue**, 1924 Garage Apartment and Duplex in College Quarter, Sunni Witmer, prospective new owner
  - a. Site Visit with Ms. Witmer to discuss what possibilities may exist for an addition to the 2-story Garage Apartment.
  - b. She wants to keep the existing buildings and scale of the existing property
  - c. Provided her with College Quarter Design Guidelines, Application and COR forms and names of other City Staff she should contact.
- 3. 635 Berkshire Avenue, 1950, Julie Kwon, Owner
  - a. Phone inquiry about process to apply for historic designation
  - b. Sent her Application for Individual Historic Designation, Incentives Lists and Historic Preservation Q+A Brochure
- 4. 146 Virginia Drive, 1930, Patricia Pattillo, Owner
  - a. Phone inquiry from Pat Estes on behalf of her friend, Patricia Pattillo as to her interest in designating her home.
  - b. Awaiting contact from Ms. Pattillo.
- 5. 1349 Essex Road, 1925, inquiry by Trevor Freeman
  - a. Historic listing of this property?
  - b. Ability to make modifications to it?
  - c. Ability to demolish the detached rear garage, or modify/make additions to it?
  - d. Replies to all questions and information regarding Individual Historic Designation and the benefits and incentives attached to that designation.

END.

Respectfully submitted.

City Architect and Liaison to the Historic Preservation Board







Please join us for

### THE WINTER PARK HISTORIC HOMEOWNERS CELEBRATION

in Honor and Appreciation of Homeowners of Designated Historic Homes

> Wine and Cheese Reception Thursday, May 10, 2018 6:30 – 8:30 p.m.

Casa Feliz Historic Home Museum 656 Park Avenue North

Please RSVP by May 1, 2018 to RSVP@CasaFeliz.us • 407-628-8196

# **IT'S PAR-TEE TIME**

thank YOU

### SWING BY FORE THE ANNUAL BOARD APPRECIATION TRIPLE CROWN EVENT WEDS 05.23 2018

please jain CITY COMMISSION & STAFF for GRAND SLAM 'TIZERS, SWEET SPOTS & DOUBLE BOGEY ADULT BEVERAGES

5:30 PM START TIME 7 PM SCRAMBLE HOME WINTER PARK COUNTRY CLUB 761 OLD ENGLAND AVE. J WINTER PARK, FL 32789

special prizes for BEST DRESSED GOLFERS (MENS & LADIES) LONGEST DRIVE & BEST PUTTING CONTESTS

**IN RECOGNITION OF -**

WO

PLEASE RSVP BY WEDS 05.16.2018 To 407-599-3463 Or JMILLER@ CITYOFWINTERPARK.ORG

your hole-in-one service to the CITY OF WINTER PARK